

UDC 94(477)«1932/1933»

DOI: 10.24919/2519-058x.11.170719

РЕЦЕНЗІЇ / REVIEWS

Oleksandr DANYLENKO

PhD hab. (History), Professor, Department of History of World Ukrainian Studies, Kyiv National Taras Shevchenko University. 60 Volodymyrska Street, Kyiv, Ukraine, postal code 01033 (ovd@ua.fm)

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9246-6574>

PUBLONS: <https://publons.com/researcher/2993903/oleksandr-danylenko/>

Svyatoslav DANYLENKO

PhD (History), Associate Professor of the Department of Source Studies and Special Historical Sciences of M. P. Drahomanov National Pedagogical University, 9 M. Pyrohova Street, Kyiv, Ukraine, postal code 02000 (s.v.danylenko@npu.edu.ua)

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0370-544X>

PUBLONS: https://publons.com/researcher/2993806/sviatoslav-danylenko

Олександр ДАНИЛЕНКО

доктор історичних наук, професор кафедри історії світового українства Київського національного університету імені Тараса Шевченка, вул. Володимирська, 60, Київ, Україна, індекс 01033 (ovd@ua.fm)

Святослав ДАНИЛЕНКО

кандидат історичних наук, доцент кафедри джерелознавства та спеціальних історичних наук Національного педагогічного університету імені М.П.Драгоманова, вул. М.Пирогова, 9, Київ, Україна, індекс 02000 (s.v.danylenko@npu.edu.ua)

MODERN VISION OF NATIONAL TRAGEDY

The Encyclopedia of Holodomor in 1932 – 1933 in Ukraine / Introductory word is written by Yevhen Nyschuk; Preface and the author's text are written by Vasyl Marochko. Drohobych: «Kolo», 2018. 576 p.

СУЧАСНА ВІЗІЯ НАЦІОНАЛЬНОЇ ТРАГЕДІЇ:

Енциклопедія Голодомору 1932 – 1933 років в Україні / Вступ. слово Євгена Нищука; Передмова, авторський текст Василя Марочка. Дрогобич: «Коло», 2018. 576 с.

In 2018 Drohobych publishing house «Kolo» published the «The Encyclopedia of Holodomor», the author of which is Professor Vasyl Marochko. In the introductory word it is marked that the above-mentioned Encyclopedia is «the first information, reference and memorial publication in Ukraine», an important «commemorative form of spreading the knowledge on the famine calamity of the Ukrainians» (с.4). Being academic both in the form and content, memorial and institutional in its aim, the encyclopedic publication is the first one in Ukrainian and foreign histo-

riographic discourses. The originality of the Encyclopedia is caused not only by the author's highlighting of the reasons, the circumstances, the socio-demographic consequences of Holodomor, the intellectual reflections of Western scientists, the discussions among the Ukrainian and Russian researchers, the peculiarities of the legal and political assessment, acquiring of the memorial status of the national tragedy and recognition of it as the genocide. The originality of the Encyclopedia is also caused with the formation of the vocabulary part, the interpretation of the very concept of the structural, compositional form of the book, its arrangement.

The slogans, i. e., the names of the encyclopedic articles, over a thousand, reproducing the events and phenomena of 1932 – 1933 in Ukraine, are problematically thematic over the chronological framework of Holodomor. The slogans relate to the historical, political, legal, socio-anthropological, statistical-demographic, administrative-territorial, personal, memorial practices. The presented material informs the reader. The author's point of view is essentially presented through an objective coverage of the events and phenomena, based on the archival sources, the periodicals, the scientific literature, and witnesses' memoirs.

In the Preface, the author noted that the «Encyclopedia of Holodomor», written by him, is the logical conclusion of a long-term scientific research work, which lasted from 1989, i. e., for thirty years. The memorial, academic edition, taking into account a huge number of works, the archival documentary editions, the collections of memoirs of the eyewitnesses of the tragedy, was in the intellectual space, especially after the period, when Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine recognized Holodomor – the genocide of the Ukrainian people (2006). The thematic impact on the way to the generalization of the phenomenon of Holodomor was the publication of the first in Ukraine a scientific, historical chronicle¹, of the events and phenomena that reveal it. Another point is the author's format of the encyclopedic edition, the preparation of which required a professional readiness, an academic responsibility and a fair intellectual ambition of the author. The above-mentioned qualities are realized, because «The Encyclopedia of Holodomor» is a historiographical and bibliographic fact, which was widely presented in the mass media, among the researchers and the museum workers in Ukraine.

To review any thematic informative and reference publication, especially encyclopedic, is difficult, since they have a well-established structure and the plot composition. «The Encyclopedia of Holodomor», written by Professor V. Marochko, did not become an exception. The Encyclopedia was compiled on the basis of the alphabetical order, i. e., from the letter «А» to «Я» (Ukrainian alphabet letters). Each of the letters is distinguished by the number of slogans (articles) presented, and their unevenness in the aspect the slogans amount is due to the historical linguistic peculiarities, because there are very few names and events on the letter «Й» (a Ukrainian letter). However, the letter «К» is presented with a number of articles, but they are not significant. The plot-structure composition of the publication, judging by the formal list of the available articles, covered about thirty problematic, thematic blocks. They are presented quite logically and gradually, taking into account the memorial and academic coverage of Holodomor in accordance with the relevant priorities: the organizers of the Holodomor-genocide (Y. Stalin, V. Molotov, L. Kaganovych, P. Postyshev, S. Kosior, V. Chubar, H. Petrovskyi and the others); the grain procurement according to the sectoral principle (in the collective farms, the state farms, the peasant households); the methods and forms of a systematic deprivation of bread and food (the repressions, the plans for the households, the black boards, the towing brigades, etc.); the reflections of the political and public figures of the West (the US presidents – F. Roosevelt, R. Reagan, D. Bush; the political activists, politicians of the European countries – E. Errio, J. Movinkel, T. Initser, E. Ammende, O. Bochkovskyi); the Ukrainian and foreign researchers (historians, demographers, sociologists,

¹ Holodomor of 1932 – 1933 in Ukraine: Chronicle / V. Marochko, O. Movchan. Kyiv: Publish. House «Kyiv-Mohyla Academy», 2008. 294 p.

ethnographers, statisticians); creative artistic intellectuals (writers, artists, film directors, journalists); the foreign diplomats of those tragic years (American, German, Italian, Polish, Latvian, Japanese); the food of hungry people («Balanda», «Varyvo», «Zatyruha», «Vyrishalnyh», etc.); the international scientific conferences; Western and Russian periodicals; Russian historiography; the international aid committees; the territorial administrative units (villages, village councils, districts, regions); the regional offices; the forms of resistance and survival (the names of peasants convicted of non-fulfillment of the plan to the court and the appeals against the grain procurement policy). The number of articles, their thematic variety and content highlight and reveal the causes and consequences of Holodomor in Ukraine. The one-volume edition of the Encyclopedia of Holodomor is finished, academic in content, but does not exhaust the depth and magnitude of the tragedy of the Ukrainian people. The author, judging by the nature of the presentation of the material, avoided the emotional component, but adhered to the principle of historicism. The absolute majority of the article titles comes from the terminology of those years («saboteurs», «experts», «tverdozdavtsi», «contractants», etc.).

The terms «famine», «holodovka», «Holodomor», «starvation catastrophe», «genocide», «Holodomor-genocide», «terror by starvation», which are key to the contemporary historiographical and memorial discourses, are scientifically grounded and historically adapted to indicate the chronology of their appearance and the etymological significance. In «The Encyclopedia of Holodomor» the names of the victims of Holodomor (more than 100 people) are mentioned; the attention is focused on the causes and the place of death. Logically, the question arises about the reasons for the author's approach to their choice, since in 2008 the memorial edition «The National Book of Holocaust Memorials of 1932 – 1933 in Ukraine» established more than 900 thousand victims named. Of course, it is very difficult to compile them in a separate volume, and the martyrologist, i.e., a list of the dead from Holodomor, may become the most adequate form of a memorial perpetuation. In the Encyclopedia, according to the author's explanation, the personal victims, in addition to the memorial component, certify the place, the time and the cause of death from starvation, i.e., the territory and the circumstances of the committing of the crime.

The notion of «Holodomor Victims» appears in the Encyclopedia as «...a historical social-age group, the dead and the victims of the artificial famine, a normative-legal category» (p. 139). Such interpretation, which is not the intellectual property of the author, as fixed in the Law of Ukraine of November 28, 2006 on the recognition of Holodomor, the genocide of the Ukrainian people, should direct the researchers, who are involved in the identification of the number of victims, but are limited only to the statistical and demographic records of the dead in 1932 – 1933. The historians have long discovered the causes of the artificial famine, which included Stalin's grain procurement policy. The discussions on Stalin's personal motivation, the possible presence of his personal order to destroy the Ukrainians physically, in our opinion, are too deductive. The question of revealing of the intent and, moreover, the actions with the intent, as envisioned by the UN Convention on the Genocide of 1948, is difficult for lawyers and historians. The author of the Encyclopedia of Holodomor dared to find out the intent in the grain procurement policy of the Soviet Party authorities. The article «Bread procurement in the Ukrainian SSR» (p. 486) introduces a new interpretation – «the actions of the officials with the intent to deprive people of food», in addition to the content list of the phenomenon itself (the centralized and decentralized forms of grain harvesting, the fulfillment of the state obligations, the administrative and repressive methods of bread depriving). The action of the authority structures was realized by means of the forms and methods of a systematic and consistent seizure of bread and other food products, and the intention to consciously and arbitrarily establish the natural size of the so-called «plan for the household» (p. 333). The action was intentionally and legally fixed in the decrees of the Soviet Party bodies. The main decrees are presented in the Encyclopedia of Holodomor (p. 347, 348).

The term «artificial famine», which arose in February 1932, has gained in the historiography of a wide-spread usage, especially among Western scholars until the late 1980-ies. In the reviewed Encyclopedia, the definition of «artificial» appears as a «functional synonym for the Holodomor-genocide of 1932 – 1933» (p. 522), not the usual antipode of a natural disaster, which led to the mass starvation, but was deliberately organized by the officials.

The articles in the Encyclopedia about the famous socio-political figures (M. Rudnytska, S. Rusova, R. Lemkin, M. Kots, L. Lukyanenko, I. Drach), the researchers (V. Hryshko, D. Solovey, O. Pidhainyi, R. Konkvest, D. Meys, V. Manyak, I. Shulha, M. Shytyuk, V. Danylov, I. Zelenin), Western journalists (G. Johns, M. Maggeridge, N. Bassehes, V. Chamberlain, G. Williams and the others), the artists (O. Dovzhenko, M. Rudenko, Ye. Sverstiuk), in addition to their individual reflections on the very phenomenon of Holodomor, represent a peculiar functional and memorial martyrologist of people who sincerely spoke the truth to the world. Among them there are the priests (A. Sheptytskyi, Mstyslav (Skrypnyk), L. Husar, Filaret). In their prayers and appeals the Ukrainian peasants, who died of artificial famine, were mentioned. Each article of the reviewed publication has a memorial status, as it shows the names of the righteous, who saved the peasants from starvation. In the articles the creators of the Holodomor-genocide are named. Each article perpetuates the collective memory of the victims, fixes the personal conscience and the ideological preferences of the scientists, the diplomats, the politicians, who interpreted the causes and consequences of the tragedy differently. «The Encyclopedia of the Holodomor» included the leading Ukrainian and Western historians, who, organizationally and intellectually, joined this academic-memorial problem (Mark von Hagen, O. Subtelnyi, L. Lutsyuk, H. Kuromia, R. Kushnezh, Y. Mytsyk, V. Smolii, S. Kulchytskyi, Yu. Shapoval, R. Serbyn, H. Boryak, Sh. Fitspatryck, L. Hrynevych, H. Yefimenko, O. Stasiuk, Vasyl Danylenko, H. Kasyanov, V. Kondrashyn, V. Kosityk, N. V. Vert, A. Hratsiosi, E. Chinnela, P. Cherneha, N. Lapchinska, O. Miller, M. Ivnytskyi and the others), as well as the statistics workers and demographers (A. Khomenko, O. Asatkin, Yu. Korchak-Chepurkivskyi, M. Ptukha, O. Volovyna, N. Levchuk).

In the article «The Territory of the Holodomor», which is a generalization of administrative, geographical, social and anthropological boundaries of the spread of the Holodomor, the intensity of mortality and starvation of people has been highlighted. It concerns the regional level, the number of affected areas, the villages and the village councils (p. 423). The detailed statement of the causes and socio-demographic implications appears in articles on the specific areas in the Ukrainian SSR. The territorial aspect is added with certain materials about the areas in each of the regions, but they do not exhaust the problem of illumination of the intensity of famine, mortality. There is a clear need to prepare a separate section on the distribution of the Holodomor in the administrative, territorial boundaries of the Ukrainian SSR in 1932 – 1933, but with a unified form of presentation of the material in each article (the population, the village councils, the villages, the mortality rates, the forms of starvation, the survival, the total losses).

Taking into account the modern information and technological world, the encyclopedic format of highlighting and interpretation of the historic past, particularly tragic, acquires an intellectual interest and applied value. Generalizing the information about the past, its exhaustiveness, the academic and correctness of the given material, its cognitive and social relevance is a requirement of time, a scientific reflection on global and regional challenges. We agree with the author that any encyclopedic edition should inform the coming and present generations, and not persuade the opponents. We share and support the hope for the appearance of such encyclopedias in the regions.

*The article was received on February 24, 2019.
Article recommended for publishing 10/06/2019.*